Chapter Three: The Archive Of Maori And Education

In this chapter a review of literature relating to Maori girls and Maori women primarily as students is undertaken. School based experiences of Maori girls are highlighted for three reasons. First, of all statistical data on Maori girls as students makes this group highly visible, while the number of studies with Maori women educators in positions of responsibility are few (Meha, 1987; Tomlins-Jahnke, 1996; Bowkett, 1996). Secondly, the contemporary experiences of Maori women in education cannot be divorced from the historical, socio-political contexts in which their current practices are embedded. Thirdly, student-based experience in education draws attention to the hurdles these educators negotiate in order to enter the profession, as a prerequisite to promotion within it. These studies suggest that educational experiences for Maori girls are distinctly different from their non-Maori peers. In contrast Maori women educators in positions of responsibility are invisible, subsumed within studies on 'Maori', or 'women' in general; as though the ideological forces shaping and differentiating the experiences of both groups no longer exist once they achieve professional status.

The studies, articles and papers reviewed in this section are organised in terms of methodological position, focus of inquiry and outcome. Figure 3.1 is a framework\(^1\) in which an overview of the literature that combines Maori and education as the primary focus is considered. Further limiting the literature search to Maori, Education and Girls or Women produces a scant reading list indeed. As noted in the Report of the Royal Commission On Social Policy,

> There is little published research on any aspect of Maori women's lives. Published material of any kind by Maori women is even more rare (1988, Vol. II, p. 157).

The framework organises studies according to the types of questions asked, the approaches taken and the outcomes. Although the stages identified have

\(^1\) This framework was adapted from the stages of research identified by Shakeshaft (1989), in her study of women in educational administration.
emerged in a semi-ordinal manner, later stages have not meant the decline or cessation of earlier approaches. Shifts in research focus have added to, modified, or in some instances refuted, earlier positions, with some later studies merging boundaries between stages.

**Figure 3.1 Stages of Research on Maori in Education**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Approach</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Absence of Maori as a distinct group documented.</td>
<td>What are the educational outcomes for Maori?</td>
<td>Empirical data, statistical compilations, Surveys that count.</td>
<td>Documentation of retention, repetition and suspension rates...</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Transformation of theory.</td>
<td>What are Maori theoretical perspectives of education?</td>
<td>Historical; written/oral, whakapapa; Kaupapa Maori theory. Alternative schools.</td>
<td>Reconceptualisation of...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

While stages one, two and four consume the largest space on library shelves, stages three, five and six are small but growing in number. The latter stages indicate a move toward Maori controlled and Maori centred research. The lineal presentation reflects the order in which stages have emerged in the
written canon. However, single factor explanations are giving way to dynamic
theories. This reflects a growing understanding of the multifaceted influences
working simultaneously to shape the educational experiences of Maori as a
group and for sub-groups within it. Latter stages reflect the reconceptualisation
of theory creating alternative educational options.

Stage 1: Absence of Maori as a distinct group

The antecedents to statistical data currently collected are to be found in
missionary records outlining funding and attendance in the annual reports of
native schools. Outside of these records there is a noted absence of data on
Maori performance in education identified by the Hunn Report (1960). The
collection of data since then has continued to monitor the position of Maori in
both the compulsory and non compulsory sectors, supplying an increasingly
broad range of statistical information.

This data is utilised in order to seek answers to questions such as:
participation through level of access, choice of programmes and levels of
failure; retention through suspension, expulsion, truancy and age of departure
from the system; along with educational outcomes that note the highest
credentials attained. The approaches taken are in the form of surveys and
other empirical data collated by the Ministry of Education.

For example in 1891 Maori girls were under-represented in the female school
population. They made up almost 5 percent of the population aged between 5-
15 years, while accounting for only 2 percent of all girls attending school

---

2 It is not my intention to presume that stages 4, 5 and 6 have not previously existed in other genre. I refer here to long standing debates regarding education that have occurred at hui on Marae that do not have the same publication track record that academic conference proceedings attract.
3 This report identified for the first time educational provision for Maori as in a state of crisis. Disparities in educational outcomes were alluded to and a move from assimilationist policies to integration suggested. Both assimilation and integration are defined.
4 In earlier times Principals were required to ascribe Maori ethnic identity to pupils. More recently ethnic ascription resides with the parent or guardian. This may have affected the validity of some of the earlier data collected.
(Statistics New Zealand, Dec. 1993). Not surprisingly (100 years later), with compulsory attendance requirements, in 1991 participation for this cohort mirrored that of their representation within the population at large.

Of the total number of students attending school in 1993, 51 percent were male, 49 percent were female. Of this group 20 percent identified themselves as Maori, with 67 percent of this group at primary school. Thus while forming 14 percent of the total population, Maori constitute 17 percent of secondary students and 22 percent of primary pupils. Demographic indices suggest that the age structure of the Maori population means Maori will form an increasing proportion of the school aged population over the next decade, and therefore an increasing proportion of those competing for school-based credentials and placement within the workforce thereafter (Durie, A., 1997).

Retention rates\(^3\), within secondary schools in 1992 suggest that of those entering secondary school in the mid to late 1980's, 91.0 percent of third to fifth form Maori females, 62.8 per cent third to sixth formers and 24.1 percent of third to seventh formers are retained. At the third to fifth form level this represents 92 percent of the participation rate of Non-Maori females. At the third to sixth form level a 69.0 percent participation rate as compared to Non-Maori and a 47.0 percent rate at the seventh form level. The raising of the school leaving age in 1992 (effective 1993) will have a significant effect on this cohort as the participation rate of 16 year old Maori girls was 88 percent. Non-Maori girls will be relatively unaffected as they have a 98 percent participation rate within this age band (Davis and Nicholl, 1993).

\(^3\) Apparent retention rates provide an estimate of the proportion of students remaining in school to a specified form level. These rates are only apparent as they do not take account of net changes to the secondary school population as result of migration, the entrance of adult students into senior school, those who spend more than one year in the same form or those who are involuntarily removed from the system. Particularly the last three factors may skew data on Maori considering the number of adults returning, the proportion who repeat fifth and/or sixth form years and their over-representation in expulsion rates. The Adult Education Act 1975 made it possible for adults to return either full or part-time to secondary schools. In 1991 Women (no ethnic breakdown) made up the majority of mature students at High Schools, Polytechnics, Universities and Teachers Colleges (Statistics NZ 1993).
Performance in 1990 indicates that 45 percent of Maori girls were awarded School Certificate grades A1-B2 compared with approximately 75 percent Non-Maori. Sixth form Certificate in the same year showed 24 percent of Maori females achieved grades of 4 or above compared with 46 percent of Non-Maori. Young Maori women are more likely than their Maori male counterparts to leave compulsory education with a qualification. However, they are still much less likely than Non-Maori women to do so. Within the compulsory sector, the pattern of early departure from the system continues to exist. This reflects in part, the tendency for some Maori children, particularly boys, to be held back in the junior classes. As a result these students reach school leaving age prior to being confronted with external examination (McDonald, 1988).

Of the Maori Female school leavers seeking direct entry in tertiary in 1991, 9.2 percent applied to Universities, 9.9 percent applied to Polytechnics and 2.7 to Teachers Colleges. This represented 21.8 of the total pool of Maori females eligible to enter post compulsory education, who left High School at the end of the 1990 school year. Overall, Maori school leavers were about half as likely as students in general to enter tertiary institutions directly from school in 1991. With 21.8 percent of those eligible entering the tertiary sector, 78.2 percent of the pool are left to compete in the workforce with credentials that have decreasing value in a credentially inflated market.

Although Maori Women are still under-represented at university, they have made rapid gains in recent years. In 1991, there were 3,210 Maori women at university, nearly three times as many as there were in 1986 (1,163). Over this period, the representation of Maori women among female university students has increased from 3.8 percent in 1986 to 7.2 percent in 1991. Nevertheless increased participation rates amongst other cohorts during this same period has meant little change in pre-existing disparities between Maori and Non-
Maori, although some shift between Maori males and Maori females is evident in favour of females.

Teacher training is one area of tertiary education where women in general have long formed a clear majority of students. In 1991, women made up 78 percent of all teacher trainees in New Zealand. The proportion of teacher trainees is highest in the Early Childhood area and declines as the age of pupils rises. For example, in 1991, women accounted for 99 percent of Kindergarten teachers, 77 percent of primary school teachers, and 51 percent of teachers in Secondary schools. A similar situation applies with respect to Senior teaching positions. In general, the higher the teaching rank, the lower the percentage of women in these positions. The 1990 Education Services Census showed that women made up 27 percent of Primary School principals and 18 percent of secondary school principals (Dunn, et al., 1993). No such break down of gender by ethnicity exists for Maori women.

In 1991, 26 percent of Maori women attending university were enrolled in education programmes at the bachelor level, compared with 10 percent of all other female students (Statistics New Zealand, 1993). Nevertheless, their participation remains distinctly different from their non-Maori peers. In spite of the increased participation of Maori women at university in 1991 this cohort was more than twice as likely, as female students in general, to be working toward undergraduate Certificates or Diplomas. Twenty one percent participated at this level compared with 9 percent of the total female university population. Attainment data shows the same pattern, with 30 percent of female Maori students completing their studies with an undergraduate Certificate or Diploma, as against 7 percent of all female students. With credential inflation devaluing the worth of many of these undergraduate credentials, correlation

---

*Comparable figures for gender breakdown of Kohanga reo staff does not exist, in part because they have not necessarily participated within post compulsory education in which the statistics are compiled and drawn. Equally there is little ethnic breakdown of gendered statistics of employees within the various education sectors.*
between tertiary participation and representation in the professions may not necessarily form a causal link.

Of those Maori women who do enrol in Bachelor programmes, Hartley (1992) notes that the largest proportion were majoring in arts and education.

One third of Maori women in universities are enrolled in bachelor programs in education, a percentage which is three times higher than the corresponding figure for all university women enrolled in such programs (p. 2).

It would then follow that within educational contexts Maori women would, more than in any other profession, by virtue of numbers have more chance attaining positions of responsibility. However, the positioning of Maori women educators in school contexts is a far more complex phenomena than a numbers game based on statistical probability would suggest.

In spite of the increases noted, the Ministry of Education Statistics Division (1989) indicates that the gap between Maori and Non-Maori educational attainment and retention rates are increasing not diminishing at the higher levels. This trend is continuing unabated (O'Neill 1990; Ministry of Education Annual Report 1993/94). The wealth of statistical information on Maori girls as the students, provides the antithesis to the paucity of data regarding the experiences of Maori women as educators. For all the gains made in education, in general, substantial gender and ethnic differences remain which need to be addressed if Maori women in particular, are to achieve their potential.

According to Ministry of Education Maori Education Statistics (1993) Maori women engaged in tertiary education have patterns of participation which are lower than their non-Maori peers. Statistics, however, illustrate objective deprivation, but fail to reveal the Maori learners experience of subjective deprivation. Subjective deprivation is defined by Penetito (1988) as the
'feelings a minority member has about their status, feelings which include a sense of powerlessness' (p. 94) caused by the denial of recognition and frustration. Wylie (1988) argues, "Maori do not intend to fail but the system acts to ensure that they do" (p. 93). Penetito (1988) states it frankly as,

... [feeling] like losing even if you’d won. If you are a Maori student in a school the more you achieve the more you are separated from your Maori peers. If you don't achieve, you get to keep your mates, but then you can't get a job. You get deprived which ever way you turn (p. 93).

A critical barrier to the movement of Maori women into universities, teacher education and to a lesser extent polytechnics can be attributed to the inadequate levels of retention in secondary schools. As a result therefore many young Maori women do not have the appropriate entry qualifications to embark on a career within education. Equally disturbing is the relatively low uptake rate of those who do hold the entry criteria but opt out of post compulsory education. As stated previously, of those who do participate within university programmes a significant number are concentrated within undergraduate certificates and diplomas.

There is no empirical research at this level on Maori women educators beyond the number graduating annually from colleges of education. We have little idea of retention rates within the profession, numbers seeking promotion, those successful in securing promotion, the quality of their experience, what they contribute to the profession, at what cost, through which strategies... or the breadth of programme types in which these women operate. While this research clearly situates Maori within the education system as students it provides no rationale as to why this is the case. Where Maori students have remained highly visible within statistical compilations that highlight their experiences of school as distinctly different from their Non-Maori peers, statistical data of workforce participation continues to highlight objective deprivation that extends beyond the school grounds. The lack of data on Maori women educators, as suggested by one Maori woman professional, may
provide part of the explanation,

"You're a Maori until you succeed. Then you're a New Zealander" (Hiha, 1994; p.89).

Stage 2: Maori as disadvantaged and subordinate

The second stage of research advances a rationale for disparities in educational outcomes between Maori and non-Maori. In seeking answers to why Maori underachieve, the focus of inquiry centres Maori students, families and communities as the primary hindrance to educational advancement. It is a theoretical position that posits cultural deficit views of Maori. Cultural deficit discourse in Aotearoa/New Zealand emerged in the 1950's and 60's marking a period of 'victim blaming' where the reason for failure vacillates between biological essentialism under the guise of eugenics⁷ and Social Darwinism⁸. It is an ideological position that maintains physiological and cultural qualities in Maori children as obstructive to educational advancement. During the 1950s and 1960s, a period of 'supposed enlightenment' (Jenkins and Ka'ai, 1994) Maori failure was couched in terms of 'cultural deprivation'. For example Ramsey et al (1984) attributed Maori failure to such factors as,

..., youthful population, large families, overcrowding in homes, sibling upbringing, group-centred ways of living, language problems, poor motivation, limited aspiration, low income, low social status (p. 48).

The essentialist argument theorised that Maori by nature were less intelligent than their Non-Maori counterparts and therefore lacking the aptitude to excel in

---

⁷ Within Eugenic explanations ethnic groups are hierarchically ordered according to race (based on physical characteristics such as size and shape of cranium). Ranking according to physiological traits has been found to have little scientific validity (Outhwaite and Bottomore 1994). As only three distinct racial groups are evident Caucasian, Negroid and Mongoloid such hierarchies are non sensical even in their own terms (UNESCO working party 1950 cited in Montague 1972). Furthermore, pseudo-scientific pursuits often confused physical, social (colonially ascribed) and cultural attributes (see James and Saville-Smith 1969 and Spoonley 1992) by collapsing them into one.

⁸ Social Darwinism advanced notions of 'survival of the fittest', attrition rates of whole ethnic groups due to socio-political factors within such a theory are reduced to 'natural' causes. Hence high Maori mortality rates, in such accounts, with newly introduced diseases, could be attributed to low level biological/physiological evolutionary factors to ward of such afflictions. Holding to such theories was a way of abdicating any social, moral or ethical responsibility on the part of the Coloniser by believing that eradication of whole populations was pre-ordained within the evolutionary process.
school based contexts (other than on the sports field, in the art room and choir). In conjunction with this, cultural factors such as: low value placed on education, lack of parental support, illiterate nature of the culture (coming from oral traditions), lack of resources within the home\(^9\), beliefs, cultural values and behaviours displayed by Maori children were seen to be inhibitive in educational settings (Irwin, 1988; Smith, G., 1990; Johnston and Pihama, 1995). In Johnston and Pihama's (1995) view,

The problem therefore becomes 'a problem' for minorities. They are blamed for their own 'inadequacies' (i.e. victim-blaming) and their own downfall... Maori were blamed for their own educational failure, and this blame was inextricably linked to their 'Maoriness'. Cultural difference, in particular, became a term synonymous with 'cultural deprivation', so not only were Maori culturally different, but this difference came to mean they were also culturally deprived (p. 81).

The outcome of such studies were 'enrichment' or 'remediation' in order to address the facets of identified 'deprivation'. Not only did this abdicate institutional responsibility for initially determining Maori educational achievement but it also saw solutions in intensified provision of programmes that had already failed to address Maori needs. Deficit views of Maori entrenched negative stereotypes, while at the same time advancing egalitarian rhetoric, meritocratic myths and the neutrality of education as a credentialling agent. In spite of losing favour as a line of investigation within the research community this approach stubbornly lingers in educational practice to this day (Simon, 1986; Hirsh, 1990; Meha, 1987). In contrast, studies of successful Maori students begin to unravel a different scenario.

**Stage 3: Search for successful Maori students**

The third stage seeks to understand the characteristics and placement of those

\(^9\) Many of these studies saw Maori culture and poverty as synonymous. It has never been a Maori cultural imperative that one must remain poor, in bad health and come from a dysfunctional family in order to sustain their Maori identity. Yet many studies collapsed these two characteristics into one. The fact that dealing with poverty has become a lived reality for many Maori it can be argued [although not developed fully in this thesis] is better attributed to the cultural imperatives situated within colonialism.
students who have achieved against the statistical odds. Studies in this area are beginning to emerge with the recording of successful Maori students in the compulsory sector (Mitchell and Mitchell, 1988); narratives of professional women working in the field of education and accounts of those who have achieved professional status within education but decided not to stay (Mitchell and Mitchell, 1993; Scott, 1997). Although few in number, qualitative studies are beginning to emerge based on Maori women at the post graduate level of study (Fuli, 1994), Maori women working in the field of eduction (Meha, 1987; Pihama and Ka'ai, 1991; Bowkett, 1996; Tomlins-Jahnke, 1996; Selby, 1995) and a growing number of successful Maori women (Marks, 1984; Te Awekotuku, 1988; Henry, 1994; Smith, L., 1997) documenting personal educational experiences.

Mitchell and Mitchell (1988) in their study; Profile of Maori pupils with high marks in School Certificate English and Mathematics found Maori were capable of high performance but not without cost. Mitchell and Mitchell using a cohort of 40 Maori students (20 male and 20 female) who attained the highest marks (in English and Mathematics combined) during School Certificate examinations in 1987 investigated the educational experiences of this group. A combination of interviews with students, their families and teachers working with this cohort was undertaken. Five concluding points are made. The first point being, "... many Maori children are not achieving according to their ability in our school system" (p. 39) of those who did, four common factors were evident. Each student experienced strong family support in which achievement and success was reinforced. The students displayed an ability to withstand peer pressure not to succeed (from Maori as well as non-Maori peers) but often at the cost of isolation from Maori peers. And finally the few who did

---

balance academic achievement with sustained Maori contact apparently did so because of outstanding personal qualities.

Although across the sites of investigation meritocratic principles were espoused with regard to school based opportunities, attempts to reconcile these principles with the number of incidents of racism cited, remained unaddressed by the researchers. For example, some of the experiences of racism included a parent intending to resign from a Board of Governors due to what was felt to be 'racist and condescending attitudes of other Board members' (p. 84). For the students, initial placement in low streams, based on ethnicity, was experienced when they changed schools. One particular student after being reassigned to a higher stream, recalls the Principal's comment as, "How nice it was to have a brown face in the top stream" (pp. 53-54, and 67) Some experienced racist remarks from other pupils (p. 67) and staff, especially when due to their fairness of skin, racist comments by staff were openly shared with students (pp. 68, and 70). One student felt particularly harassed at school 'because of his relationship to a well-know Maori spokesperson" (p. 70). Yet another student spoke of offering support to a Non-Maori student having difficulty in mathematics only to have the relieving teacher assume it was her (the Maori student) experiencing difficulty. Finally many of the respondents cite low expectations of staff, Maori and Non-Maori peers of Maori in relation to academic performance (p. 56).

Hirsh's (1990) investigation of the issues affecting achievement of Maori educators suggests that professional burnout is 'acute and needs urgent attention' (p. 62). Although there is no gender division it was made abundantly clear by a number of respondents that, as Maori staff potential burnout is derived from,

... not only (having) their regular job to do, as do all Pakeha professionals, but they have regular hui to attend, usually over weekends, they must often travel to their home Maraee to consult with their people and equally importantly they have an educative role to fulfil
with their own whanau and iwi. As if this wasn't enough they are frequently expected, or at least called upon, by their Pakeha colleagues to assist with coming to grips with bicultural issues (p. 63).

Many other accounts come from conference papers, women interviewed for magazines, and tertiary students' publishing work, reiterate the same point, that, educational experiences appear to be qualitatively different to those of non-Maori peers. Many of these self analytical dissertations also equally fit within stage four, with these women sharing experiences unfiltered by other people's organisational frameworks. Marks' (1984) provides an example of such writing. In addressing the difficulties and frustrations encountered by a Maori teacher and Maori pupils she concludes,

The frustrations of being a Maori language teacher are essentially summed up in the feeling that the education system has invited you to be a mourner at the tangihanga of your culture, your language - and yourself (p. 3).

Te Awekotuku (1991), equally reveals many of the confusing and contradictory experiences education offered her during impressionable years growing up, as does Mead (L., 1997) who supplies critical accounts of her experiences as both a student and an educator within general stream education.

What is most evident across all of these groups is that success within general stream educational institutions is not without substantial cost above and beyond the cost expected by their Pakeha counterparts. They are experiences interspersed with threads of racism, sexism and classism that require negotiation and strategic manouevring if success is to be attained. This is further evidenced, in the next section, in studies carried out with Maori teachers who leave the profession.

The findings of Mitchell and Mitchell (1993) seem to suggest that the issues for Maori teachers and those of Maori children in schools are both interrelated and complex, with racism as the most pervasive predeterminer. Mehia (1987)
maintains,

.. this complexity has developed from a curious mix of historical, cultural, organisational, and philosophical factors (p. 120).

The themes found in Miha's study, are also reflected in Mitchell and Mitchell’s (1993) research and Scott's thesis (1997). Miha raised the issue of stress in relation to those still within the system, while the latter two indicated that stress became the catalyst for many Maori to leave the profession. Stress was related to schools delegating responsibility to Maori staff all issues involving Maori pupils and whanau that is, discipline, counselling and liaison with Maori in and out of school. The general lack of fiscal and staffing support for Maori initiatives was also commonly identified. In addition, collegial ignorance of issues and lack of preparedness to support innovative initiatives combined with the expectation that being Maori made you an instant expert on all things pertaining to Te Ao Maori, often resulted in high levels of frustration and low levels of job satisfaction.

Stage 4: Maori studied on their own terms

In contrast to stage two, stage four provides analytical critique of the institutions in which Maori are educated. The most common element of this theoretical position is the notion of institutional racism. Eckermann in defining institutional racism states,

Institutional racism is covert and relatively subtle; it originates in the operation of essential and respected forces in the society and is consequently accepted. It manifests itself in the laws, norms and regulations which maintain dominance of one group over another. Because it originates out of society's legal, political and economic system, it is sanctioned by the power group in that society and at least tacitly accepted by the powerless, it receives very little condemnation (p.33).

Spoonerly (1984) concurs with Eckermann, however, both fail to consider gender dynamics evident within these groups and the power relationships which are created as a consequence. Studies, articles and theoretical
positions investigating institutional arrangements in Aotearoa/New Zealand (Simon, 1984; Codd et al, 1985; Penetito, 1988; Meha, 1987; Hirsh, 1990; Smith, G., 1992; Hollings, 1991; Harker, 1990; Pihama and Ka'ai, 1988) and international writers (Bourdieu, 1974; Gramsci, 1971; Apple, 1982; Connell, 1988; Banks, 1994; Freire, 1994, 1996), cite inequities in the application of ideological positions that underpin what constitutes education and its provision. It is argued that both structures and processes fail to recognise cultural capital other than that of the dominant group.

The reasons for the inequalities experienced by subordinate groups within publicly funded education have been theorised by writers centralising the role and function of education as a reproductive agent in society (Bourdieu, 1974; Bowles and Gintis, 1976; Nash, 1986; Harker, 1990; Corson, 1992). At a theoretical level an understanding of cultural capital, habitus, symbolic violence and the affects of imposed ideological constructs (such as assimilation) has been developed. Such positions maintain that schools based on class (in monocultural contexts) or assimilation (in ethnically diverse contexts) reproduce existing social and cultural systems via a process of exclusion. Hegemonic practices act in ways to ensure that inequity is accepted by both those who are empowered and disempowered through the apparatus of state. Thus social stratification and the maintenance of the status quo is rationalised and accepted as the norm. Walker (1984) reiterates this notion with regard to Maori in his assertion that,

education is geared to single frame of reference, purveying and perpetuating a cultural tradition of West European society that is ethnocentric and middle class oriented (p. 26).

He argues that educational underachievement of Maori can be attributed to an education system that advances European cultural knowledge as objective and neutral while casting all others as subjective and biased. Although these
claims become difficult to counter\textsuperscript{11} and they are certainly not refuted within this thesis, this position taken in isolation provides limited theoretical scope to consider the ways in which resistance, agency or change is initiated in the production of counter-hegemonic practice.

Harker (1990) provides some insight into the factors that explain some of the complexities, utilising reproduction theories, that shape the experiences of Maori girls and women in education as students and as staff. He applies Bourdieu's theory in an analysis of educational outcomes between dominant and non-dominant groups. In providing a typology, he maintains there are five levels in which inequalities are evident. First, low achievement rates are attributed to institutional racism. At the second level, those who are successful are often misdirected in the further educational and career options that they pursue. At level three, assimilative expectations by those in positions of power increase whereby, only practices that mirror those of the dominant group in positions of authority are recognised and rewarded. Level four, 'the denigration of the academic', whereby examiners look for style opposed to content (which Bourdieu argues, is a product of the cultivated class, and can never be fully mastered by those without the appropriate background) further excludes those outside the privileged class. The fifth and final level of educational subjugation noted as credential inflation suggests students having attained higher qualifications face the prospect of employers turning to other criteria for selection purposes such as, style and language. While the analysis identifies the form and function of hegemonic practice that impact on Maori entering the workforce, no insight into the strategies employed by groups to negotiate, struggle and resist such practices is alluded to, which assumes passive acceptance of such hegemones.

\textsuperscript{11} Particularly when historical research provides evidence of explicit attempts to subordinate Maori values, beliefs and practices and contemporary statistical data regarding participation and attainment of Maori (Davies and Nicholl 1993), reveal that educational practices continue to offer little change in the way of educational outcomes for Maori students.
Similarly, teacher expectation and school resource theories tend to advance 'done to scenarios'. Although neither (processual or structural features alone) encompass the multitude of factors working simultaneously to shape the school based experiences of this group, it does however mark a change in focus that no longer takes for granted the neutrality of education. A number of studies (Simon, 1986; Pihama and Ka'ai, 1988; Hirsh, 1990; Mitchell and Mitchell, 1993; Simon, 1986 and 1990; O'Neill, 1996) identify conscious and unconscious preconceptions held by teaching staff of Maori children derived from deficit models, underpinning their professional practice. Even in instances where staff appeared genuine in their attempt to make positive differences, these professionals continued to draw from deficit indices to explain deferential educational attainment between their Maori and non-Maori charges. Hence stock solutions drawn upon to support Maori students inevitably served to maintain Pakeha interests and assumed superiority of European knowledge (Simon, 1986). Ennis (1987) as school inspector for some 18 years was pointed in his claim:

> While you read these lines thousands of Maori children attending New Zealand schools are being subjected to a 10 year process of schooling that effectively and efficiently atrophies their potential growth as people (p. 21).

He goes on to state that few teachers saw schools contributing to the problem of differential attainment of Maori students to their Non-Maori peers. He attributes this to the fact that the majority of teachers are monocultural and middle class, knowing relatively little about things Maori, leading to many teachers having,

> ... low expectations of Maori children and hold further deficit models about Maori children's competence with English, their intelligence, their home environments, their health and much more (p. 22).

In 1987 an historical study of archival records regarding the education of Maori women from the early 1900's to the time of writing was carried out by Pihama and Ka'ai (1988). They found little material specific to Maori women but a
plethora of information related to the education of Maori as a homogeneous group. However from the dearth of information some recurrent themes were drawn from the data as they related to Maori women’s experiences of schooling. These were: the differentiated curriculum that emphasised domestic skills for Maori girls; psychological effects of subordinating Maori language and culture; the imposition of Pakeha values and the experiences of institutional racism. The study concluded that the existing inequalities within the educational system doubly oppressed Maori women. In the first instance oppression was based on culture, while in the second instance by gender.

Meha (1987) and Te Moana (1993) reiterate these themes. Meha, locating herself as a participant researcher provides a qualitative study with a small sample that spans urban and rural areas, drawing on the experiences of both Maori women staff members and Maori girls as pupils. Both studies concluded that, despite the participants being hindered by constraints derived from the racist attitudes of colleagues (often including unsympathetic male principals), and considering that they worked in schools that lacked the commitment to effect positive change, participants generally remained positive about what they did.

However, not all Maori teaching professionals have been able to remain positive about the profession in the face of multifaceted adversity. Mitchell and Mitchell\(^2\) (1993) with a sample of 74 Maori teachers (43 men and 31 women) and Scott (1997), with a smaller qualitative study involving 5 Maori women, investigated why Maori leave the teaching profession. Both studies identify structures, processes and ideological factors as contributing to high levels of stress. In many instances burnout, or lack of recognition and support led to either retraction of service or movement into other areas of education. For

\(^2\) Although 74 past teachers were used a further 110 were identified but not included in the sample due to ‘research constraints’. Coding of data within the project allows for clear distinction between male and female responses.
example many respondents, in order to place themselves in positions where they were better able to effect change, moved into the Ministry of Education or Colleges of Education. Arguably this group is better understood within the parameters of production theories (Gramsci, 1971; Weiler, 1988; Giroux, 1992; Freire, 1996) emphasising that individuals are not simply acted upon by abstract structures but actively grapple with forms of resistance and accommodation to create meaning of their own.

Hence while the identification of obstructive processes and practices hindering the advancement of non-dominant groups is important to this study, it is as a means of understanding the multifaceted and multilevelled struggle required to contest such influences, not as a means of suggesting that the women in this study (or Maori in general) are inactive agents as either students or staff. The focus of this study is centred on the strategies these women employ to negotiate pervasive ideologies and practices in order to attain their aspirations in the field of education and sustain their Maori identity.

No quantitative studies exist documenting the career paths, lengths of service in the classroom or administrative positions held by Maori women. Such studies would give an indication of factors contributing to attrition and retention at a time where recruitment of Maori into teaching is presently seen as a priority. Nevertheless recruitment drives mean little if, after costly training is completed, competent Maori professionals burn out and get out because little is done in the way of retention.

Answering such questions is currently based on assumption and conjecture with little in the way of empirical or qualitative data focused on the strategies this group employs. In spite of the Ministry of Education's support of studies addressing the position of women in general in Education through their "Teacher Career and Promotion Study" (TECAPS 1987 through to 1993) we
are no closer to understanding where Maori women fit within such institutions. The absorption of Maori women within women in general renders them invisible\textsuperscript{13}. From the dearth of statistical information on Maori women educators in the primary sector one could draw the false conclusion that those who are retained within the compulsory sector long enough to meet the entry criteria into tertiary education and to exit with a qualification, have been successfully assimilated to the extent of becoming 'one' with their Non-Maori peers. Neither qualitative studies (Mitchell and Mitchell, 1993; Scott, 1997), nor anecdotal records of Maori women educators support such an assumption. The sustained interest in data collection regarding Maori girls as students, making them highly visible, provides the antithesis of what is known about Maori women as educators.

In summary, the stages thus far question why the disparities between Maori and Non-Maori exist in education. In stages two and four, the foci of study are polarised. Stage two has tended to seek answers located in the 'failing' individual, their families and culture. The outcome has been the development of remedial programmes including disproportionately high numbers of Maori children being held back to repeat classes. However, providing the child with intensified programmes that failed to meet their needs in the first instance has meant structural and processual factors within institutions remained unchallenged and unmodified, thus, resulting in unchanged disparities. The opposing position (stage four) identifies educational arrangements as obstructive. The outcome of this stage is to seek remediation not for the culturally deprived child but for the culturally deprived (Ryan, 1976) monocultural institutions that Maori children are legally compelled to attend. Nevertheless these outcomes have not changed the locus of control; who

\textsuperscript{13} Statistical compilations within the Ministry of Education, the New Zealand Educational Institute (NZEI), the Principals Association and the Ministry of Women's Affairs have yet to verify the position of Maori women within the primary sector of education. Information regarding positions and number of applications lodged for senior teacher to G5 positions based on ethnicity within the primary service is non-existent according to personal communication with these agencies.
makes decisions about curriculum, pedagogy and assessment has remained fundamentally the same. This has meant the development of ethnic additive programmes that become appendages to the 'real' curriculum (Banks, 1994). Both stages identify barriers to educational advancement for Maori children, but while the first advances culture as obstructive the second argues that structural arrangements, curriculum, pedagogical practices and assessment in educational institutions act exclusively.

Stage 5: Maori as a challenge to theory

Studies identified as fitting into stage five ask questions about the validity of existing theory and its ability to provide the explanatory power to encapsulate Maori experience in contemporary society. Such studies challenge claims of educational neutrality and value free scientific inquiry. They question historical, socio-political and pseudo-scientific explanations of who Maori are, what Maori look like and how Maori behave. They are transitional in nature providing a shift in emphasis from research done on Maori to research being done by Maori and with Maori. This is not to suggest that Maori or Non-Maori have not positively contributed to or participated in the previously identified stages. However, while the focus of investigation is often consistent with those cited in earlier stages, these studies question established methodologies, seeking methodological positions considered valid and reliable according to Maori definition.

The majority of studies are qualitative (providing the scope for narratives), and critical in design. Thus, they not only provide descriptive accounts of Maori experience within educational contexts but seek answers to questions such as whose interests are being served by existing theory, structures and educational processes. Such writers are locating themselves under the broad umbrella of Kaupapa Maori or Maori centred research. This position will be
discussed further in the methodological chapter.

Of particular relevance to this study is Puketapu's thesis (1993, He Mata Ngaro: Maori Leadership in Educational Administration). What the participants in Puketapu's dissertation identify as significant are intertwined with the past, present and future locations of Maori and their current roles in education. His combined focus on Maori and educational leadership incorporates professional and community views. He distils twelve conclusions drawn together under three broad themes: historical antecedents, current aspirations and expectations and, professional development.

There is general agreement across the groups in Puketapu's study pertaining to the significance of commitment to improve the position of Maori in education and the need for achieved leadership. Equally, agreement on the insignificance of 'results oriented approaches'; 'international knowledge' and 'skills and group acceptance variables', was maintained. Puketapu (1993) says of this,

... the position for international knowledge and skills in this quadrant (trivia quadrant) is thought provoking to say the least. In particular because all groups agree with this position. Speculatively, it could be argued that respondents focused on variables which respond to their perception of a Maori leadership identity, more closely associated with cultural imperatives. Further consideration suggests that international knowledge and skills are not perceived to be in crises or in need of maintenance by Maori educational administrators (p.164).

With the location of achievement orientation and international knowledge falling within the trivia quadrant Maori professionals are likely to remain on a collision course with current educational policies and objectives. Although Puketapu identifies two alternative interpretations of these results, a third reading is possible, that is that responses are not only a backlash resulting from historical policies and practices (derived from an international body of knowledge advancing tenuous truth claims that have poorly serviced Maori educational aspirations) but also the active production of alternative localised
As with this study, the strongest unifying variable in their professional role, was the commitment to improve the position of Maori. Puketapu found women respondents sceptical about the state of Maori knowledge and skill and Maori integrity, indicating these variables were in need of maintenance. Closely aligned was a scepticism of the moral and ethical dimensions of educational leadership. Though why this is so was not fully explored, the dubious ethic that underpins the rewriting of the place of Maori women in customary society and the general acceptance of such a dislocation by Non-Maori (men and women) and Maori men is a concern. Furthermore the ethics of supplanting one cultural stock of knowledge for another, while having little understanding of what was being replaced, raises questions. Would these issues arise for Maori women working in bilingual and kura kaupapa Maori programmes?

Stage five challenges methodological issues regarding the purpose of research, the way research projects have been initiated, how they are negotiated, what is considered ethical, who participates in research projects and issues of reciprocity\(^{14}\) (Durie, A., 1992). It further highlights cultural bias in methodological positions that have previously proved to be detrimental to those being researched including, by default, findings seen as equally applicable, and therefore detrimental, to all Maori. While some researchers work within iwi defined contexts, others work in organisations. This stage deconstructs the homogeneity myth by engaging with the diverse Maori realities. The studies often challenge the explanatory power of current theories to adequately explain the multilevelled, multifaceted social, political and economic realities and aspirations of Maori.

\(^{14}\) The level of accountability is intensified for Maori researchers if for no other reason than that at the completion of projects, they are unable to divorce themselves from the group with whom they are involved. An example of the treatment of reciprocity is Kuni Jenkins, who, after researching the history of Hukarere Maori Girls College took leave from her university position to be Principal of the school for a year.
Stage 6: Transformation of theory

Stage six focuses on emerging forms of research both within and outside the written archive. The number of writers writing specifically in relation to Maori and education are not as yet, great in number. Nevertheless, Linda and Graham Smith, Walker, Hohepa, Johnston and Pihama, Jenkins, Durie, Jahnke, Soutar, Te Awekotuku, Irwin, Penetito, McArthey, Ka'ai, Bishop, Pere, Puketapu and Royal are Maori academics who are grappling with the challenges that this stage presents. The transformation of theory through practice is most evident in the establishment and growth of Kohanga Reo programmes based on Maori philosophical and pedagogical action and theory. Mead (1996) writes,

Te Kohanga Reo marks a major shift in the perceptions Maori held about development, about education and about our own cultural survival. Its beginnings brought back to the centre of Maori life the role of Kaumatua or elders, the relationship between kaumatua and mokopuna and the importance of Te reo Maori as one of the foundations of our different world views and value systems (pp. 74-75).

Kohanga Reo, established in 1982, has been a successful community initiative that has had far reaching ramifications beyond the centre of the nest. As a statement of concern about the past intent, practices and outcomes of research projects focusing on Maori it has also contributed to the discourse on research through 'deliberate policies of exclusion which kept out officials and researchers' (1996, p. 78). This grass roots initiative has given rise to a voice that reverberates through educational policy, practice research discourse and beyond, particularly for those considering Maori. Mead suggests that the Kohanga Reo movement and its broader ramifications can be viewed in frames. She writes of its catalytic qualities as frames that have provided a language of possibility, a language of hope, political growth in the realisation of rangatiratanga, educational discourse and social relations. Kohanga provided the base upon which each frame was to have an impact on Maori
actively involved in Kohanga and for many outside it. The ripple on effects have extended to the core of educational provision at all levels. It has been the forerunner to an educational discourse that encompasses hope, possibility, potentiality to a level unprecedented since missionary and state intervention in the educational practices of Maori.

Hohepa (1990) and Pihama (1993) indicate that theoretical conceptualisation of Kohanga was predicated on three basic principles: the revitalisation of te reo Maori; the revitalisation of whanau and the revitalisation of mana motuhake. Achieving the first principle was incumbent on the second. Revitalising the reo meant extended whanau links with a generation of Kaumatua that still had the language, and a generation of parents of children who were the initial target group. The realisation of Mana motuhake, Maori self determination, became apparent as whanau not only rose to the challenge but were also capable of achieving what a well resourced government, had failed to do - (re)enchant Maori with education. At a later point many kohanga stipulated specific entry criteria, for example, requiring parents to be actively involved in learning the language in order to support the language needs of their children in the home. Furthermore it demanded that many whanau members, mainly women, acquire a raft of administration skills in order to secure funding, buildings and resources. Henry (1994) writes, with regard to the impact of kohanga reo in the business sector,

... Kohanga reo, have since done more to retain the Maori language and culture, and upskill Maori women in management, than any other initiative over the last one hundred years (p. 101).

Such an effective alternative education system, conceptualised on a Maori philosophical base, has not escaped backlash by those critical of separate systems. Yet ironically, separate systems for Maori have been state policy for longer than integration. What is new and threatening is the locus of control residing with Maori. Often ignored within criticisms of separatism are the number of alternative educational options such as Rudolf Steiner, Montessori
and schools developed around religious philosophies, that continue to flourish in this country based on principles ignored in general stream education.

The large scale theory in practice juxtaposed with the small number of research projects in the sixth stage is primarily due to Maori scepticism of research. Past experience with researchers (in and outside education), their (methodologies employed) and the often detrimental effects of ethnocentric analyses and publication of findings (with little in the way of reciprocity for the communities studied) has created a reluctance from Maori to engage in formalised research activity. Equally, many of the most qualified to carry out research (meeting both academic and cultural criteria) are encased within the time consuming and critical areas of teaching, resource creation and professional development of staff and community liaison. Nevertheless the level of debate at whanau and national hui suggests that critical self-reflection, aimed at continued improvement of educational provision, remains a central component of education for Maori by Maori.

These stages of research provide an overview of the ways in which Maori have been represented in educational research. Within the framework, a move toward Maori-centred research is evidenced. The level of research interest generated by government departments on Maori students serves to highlight the differentiated experiences of Maori and Non-Maori during both compulsory and non-compulsory education. This suggests the need to explore the issues impacting on Maori educators (and on Maori women in particular for this thesis) and the strategies they employ to sustain an interest in their career and maintain a Maori identity.

Drawing the archives together

This literature review has traversed two cultural archives in order to provide an
overview of Maori women in positions of responsibility. Chapter one argued that the narrative archive, positions Maori women complimentarily with men. These narratives normalise the contribution of women in the socio-political and economic affairs of customary Maori society. They are seen as figures of authority and power in their own right, not because they reflect or emulate the characteristics of men.

The second chapter reviewed the position of women in the evolution of leadership studies in the Western archive. Early studies were shown to have privileged the position of men. Men being powerful and authoritative was seen as 'natural' and 'normal'. This view assumed that women holding positions of leadership did so because they stood outside the norm of femininity. Therefore women who lead were seen to do so because they replicated the traits and characteristics of men. Recent research was drawn on to challenge the narrow conceptualisations of leadership on the basis of its Eurocentric and androcentric bias. This research suggests that there is still much to be understood about leadership and in particular about the people and contexts in which this socially constructed phenomena occurs.

The third chapter in this literature review has drawn the previous two archives together. It has shown Maori subsumed within the Western archive and the Western archive as a tool for expression of Maori focused research. A framework was prepared for an overview of studies that reflect a movement toward kaupapa Maori or Maori-centred research in an attempt to understand the position of Maori in education as students and educators. The position of Maori students progressing through education, and educators' experience of it as a workplace, was discussed and it was shown that in some studies Maori students are clearly recognised as having distinctly different objective and subjective experiences of education. A few studies on Maori educators have identified workplace expectations as being detrimentally different to those of
their Non-Maori colleagues, but little is known about the experience of Maori women educators holding positions of responsibility, working in the primary sector. Yet this sector has historically attracted the largest proportion of Maori women seeking a professional career.